# FUZZ-IEEE 2012 Paper #236 Decision Notification

4 messages

**James M.Keller <fuzzieee2012@ieee-cis.org>**                              **Tue, Feb 21, 2012 at 1:11 PM**
Reply-To: "James M.Keller" <fuzzieee2012@ieee-cis.org>
To: pablo.cingolani@mcgill.ca, jalcala@decsai.ugr.es

Dear Author(s),

Congratulations! On behalf of the FUZZ-IEEE 2012 Technical Program Committee
and the program chairs, we are pleased to inform you that your paper:

    Paper ID:   236
    Author(s):  Pablo Cingolani and Jesus Alcala-Fdez
    Title:      jFuzzyLogic: A Robust and Flexible Fuzzy-Logic Inference System Language Implementation

has been accepted for presentation at the 2012 IEEE International Conference
on Fuzzy Systems and for publication in the conference proceedings published
annually by IEEE. This email provides you with all the information you require
to complete your paper and submit it for inclusion in the proceedings.  A
notification of the presentation format (oral or poster) and timing of that
presentation will be sent by the end of May.

Here are the steps you must follow:

1. Please see the attached FORMATTING REQUIREMENTS and REVIEWERS' COMMENTS for
your paper, which are intended to help you to improve your paper for final
publication. The listed comments should be addressed, as acceptance is
conditional on appropriate response to the requirements and comments.

2. Please prepare your manuscript for final camera ready submission following
the same PDF format guidelines as for the initial submission. Papers are
limited to eight (8) pages in length, must be IEEE Xplore-compatible, and must
follow the formatting instructions provided at:

   http://www.ieee-wcci2012.org

When you have completed your paper and are ready to submit it, please go to:

   http://ieee-cis.org/conferences/fuzzieee2012/upload.php?PaperID=236

to submit your final camera-ready paper.  On this page you will need to use
the following password:

   gt85v33g

which is valid only for a single submission of your final camera-ready paper
and you cannot submit any subsequent revision. Final papers MUST be submitted
by April 2, 2012. Any papers submitted after this date run the risk of not
being included in the proceedings. The paper must be re-submitted even if the
reviewers indicated that no changes are required.

IMPORTANT: Please note that once you submit your paper, you cannot submit any
subsequent revision.  All papers submitted through the web site are considered
to be in final form and ready for publication.  Do not submit your paper until
you are ready.  A good suggestion is to have a few colleagues review your
paper to provide final remarks on its suitability before submitting it through
the web site. In addition please note that the proceedings will be printed in
black and white, not in color and it is the author's responsibility to ensure
that all figures/plots can be printed and understood in black and white.

3. In order for your paper to be published in the conference
 proceedings, a *signed IEEE Copyright Form* must be submitted for each
 paper.  FUZZ-IEEE 2012 has registered to use the IEEE Electronic Copyright
 (eCF) service.  The confirmation page shown after submitting
 your final paper contains a button linking directly to a secure IEEE
 eCF site which allows electronic completion of the copyright assignment
 process.  In case it fails, please have the completed IEEE Copyright
 Form, found at http://www.ieee.org/web/publications/rights/copyrightmain.html,
 emailed it to the Publication Co-Chair, Daryl Essam (d.essam@adfa.edu.au).

 IMPORTANT: No paper can be published in the proceedings without being

accompanied by a Completed IEEE Copyright Transfer Form.  You must complete and submit this form to have your paper included in the conference proceedings.

4. Register for the conference at http://www.ieee-wcci2012.org by clicking on the conference registration link on the right-hand side of the main page.

IMPORTANT: Each paper must have a corresponding registered author to be included in the proceedings.  Papers that do not have an associated registered author will not be included in the proceedings.  The deadline for author registration is April 2, 2012 so be sure to register by that time to ensure that your paper is included in the proceedings.  Registering late may mean that your paper may not appear in the proceedings.  Please ensure that you complete your registration early.

5. Make your hotel reservation for the FUZZ-IEEE 2012 with information obtained on the hotel reservation link "Accommodation" of the main FUZZ-IEEE 2012 page at http://www.ieee-wcci2012.org.

If you have any questions regarding the reviews of your paper please contact James M. Keller <fuzzieee2012@ieee-cis.org>. Thank you for participating in what promises to be an excellent meeting.

Sincerely, James M. Keller <fuzzieee2012@ieee-cis.org>

### FORMATTING REQUIREMENTS

Your paper does not need any formatting changes.

### REVIEWERS' COMMENTS

---------------------------------------------
REVIEW NO. 1

Originality:            Weak Accept
Significance of topic:    Accept
Technical quality:       Weak Accept
Relevance to FUZZ-IEEE 2012:Strong Accept
Presentation:            Weak Accept
Overall rating:          Accept

Reviewer's expertise on the topic: High
Suggested form of presentation:    Oral
Best Paper Award nomination:       No

Comments to the authors:
  This work is definitely related to the topics of the session on "Software for
  Soft Computing". It presents jFuzzyLogic, an open source library for making
  easier the design of fuzzy controllers. The manuscript is well-written and
  organized. I only have some minor comments and suggestions aimed to improve even
  more the quality of the present work:

  1) In section II, authors claim "a comparison of freely available fuzzy logic
  software" but what about commercial software?

  2) Even though the paper focuses on fuzzy control, please notice that there are
  some free software tools (that should be taken into account in this work) for
  fuzzy modeling which offer advances methods for generation of fuzzy systems no
  matter the specific application domain where they will be used. Look at tools
  like Xfuzzy (http://www2.imse-cnm.csic.es/Xfuzzy/), Fispro
  (http://www.inra.fr/mia/M/fispro/FisPro_EN.html), GUAJE
  (http://www.softcomputing.es/guaje), etc. Obviously, partitions and rules
  designed with such tools may be later translated into the FCL format and being
  used with jFuzzyLogic.

  3) You should remark, someway, on TableI those five software packages that
  "seemed to be maintained, compiled correctly, and had extensive functionality",
  putting special emphasis on those two which are based on jFuzzyLogic.

  4) TableI includes information about the number of membership functions (MF),
  but what about their type/shape?

  5) Be careful, Table II (page4) should turn up before Table III (page3). In
  addition, check the use of quotation marks in TableIII.

  6) Are tables II to V formal tables? In fact, they are listing code. You should
  use verbatim package or something similar.

7) You should plot the fuzzy partitions related to the example detailed in Tables II and III. It would help to understand better the example making it much more illustrative. Moreover, the rule base defined is made up of only three rules and as a result it is incomplete, i.e., it does not cover all possible situations. What is the suggested tip in case service=1 and food=4 (in the current example none of the three rules would be fired)?

8) The notation used in Tables II, IV and V are not exactly the same. For instance, Table II does not include DEFAULT related to DEFUZZIFY. AND/ACT/ACCU are also missing in the RULEBLOCK. This fact should be corrected or explicitly noted in the paper.

9) In Section III.C authors state that "a few optimization algorithms are already implemented... other optimization algorithms can be implemented". Coming back to what I say in 2) there are many algorithms useful for fuzzy modeling that may be directly applicable in the context of jFuzzyLogic. The only thing missing is the right parser to translate from one format to other.

10) In Fig.3, be sure that variable names are in accordance with Table IV, but also with the related explanation in Section IV (page5).

11) In "Acknowledgement" use the full names of authors instead of PC and JAF.

Some minor typos:

1) "Figure" should be substituted by "Fig." according to WCCI templates.

2) "of a [the] wall following" (page5)

3) "The [main] requirement[s] ... is[are]..." (page5)

4) "More than one output variable[s]" (page5)

5) Check the use of quotation marks all along the paper.

6) Ref2. pages?

7) Ref5. "An introduction[industrial] reality"

8) Ref10. C.J. Cabrera J.A. ?

9) Ref11. I.E.C.?

-------------------------------------------
REVIEW NO. 2

Originality:            Strong Accept
Significance of topic:    Accept
Technical quality:       Accept
Relevance to FUZZ-IEEE 2012:Strong Accept
Presentation:            Accept
Overall rating:          Accept

Reviewer's expertise on the topic: High
Suggested form of presentation:    Oral
Best Paper Award nomination:       No

Comments to the authors:
  The paper presents a library for designing fuzzy logic controllers. The library is called jFuzzyLogic. It is written in Java and respects the FCL (fuzzy control language) IEC-61131-7 specifications. FCL is an instruction list oriented programming language.
  The aim is to provide a standardized language and parser, which could be interesting for designing industrial fuzzy controllers.

  The paper is clear and easy to read.

  However some points are questionable.
  1-The state of the art of fuzzy logic software given in the introduction is incomplete and does not include fuzzy software such as Xfuzzy, FisPro, Guaje, Nefclass... It should absolutely be completed to avoid giving false information to the readers.
  2-Another flaw is the use of misleading terms in Part IIIB. What the authors call aggregation is usually called combination in rule premises. Similarly, activation is in fact the result of an implication operator. Activation should not be confused with rule matching degree.
  Here again, accumulation is usually called rule aggregation.

3-Part IIIb mentions that the membership functions (MFs) are systematically discretized. It seems a pity for analytical forms very easy to compute such as trapezoidal or triangular MFs.

The paper quality would be improved if the authors could address the following two topics:
1- hierarchical controllers.
How is one block linked to another one?
2- optimization.
Is the specification of the data used for optimizing the membership functions included in the FLC model?

English spelling and grammar: could be improved.
for instance: page2, these limitation -> these limitations
page 4, non neglible -> non-neglectable
page 5, gradient descend -> gradient descent
page 5, a the wall -> the wall
case of study -> case study

-------------------------------------------
REVIEW NO. 3

Originality:            Accept
Significance of topic:    Accept
Technical quality:        Accept
Relevance to FUZZ-IEEE 2012:Strong Accept
Presentation:            Accept
Overall rating:          Accept

Reviewer's expertise on the topic: Medium
Suggested form of presentation:    Any
Best Paper Award nomination:       No

Comments to the authors:
  The paper is acceptable, but I would be happier if it had stronger evaluation
  section.

---

**Jesus Alcala-Fdez <jalcala@decsai.ugr.es>**                                        **Thu, Feb 23, 2012 at 1:56**
To: Pablo Cingolani <pablo.e.cingolani@gmail.com>

Dear Pablo.

Congratulations, the paper has been accepted.

Now, we have to do the comments of the reviewers. In order to organize this task, I can do the comments of the referees 2 and 3 and you can do the comments of referee 1. Moreover, I want to do a number of minor changes in the references because we have some mistakes. Is it Ok for you?

Please, send me the last sources because I have only the pdf file.

Best regards.
Jesus

El 21/02/2012 19:11, James M.Keller escribió:

    Dear Author(s),

    Congratulations! On behalf of the FUZZ-IEEE 2012 Technical Program Committee
    and the program chairs, we are pleased to inform you that your paper:

        Paper ID:   236
        Author(s):  Pablo Cingolani and Jesus Alcala-Fdez
        Title:      jFuzzyLogic: A Robust and Flexible Fuzzy-Logic Inference System Language Implementation

    has been accepted for presentation at the 2012 IEEE International Conference
    on Fuzzy Systems and for publication in the conference proceedings published
    annually by IEEE. This email provides you with all the information you require
    to complete your paper and submit it for inclusion in the proceedings.  A
    notification of the presentation format (oral or poster) and timing of that
    presentation will be sent by the end of May.

    Here are the steps you must follow:

    1. Please see the attached FORMATTING REQUIREMENTS and REVIEWERS' COMMENTS for
    your paper, which are intended to help you to improve your paper for final
    publication. The listed comments should be addressed, as acceptance is